



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

CORRESPONDENCE FOLLOWING THE COMMITTEE MEETING

Committee ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Date and Time of Meeting TUESDAY, 21 JANUARY 2020, 4.30 PM

Please find below correspondence send by the Committee Chair following the meeting, together with any responses received.

For any further details, please contact scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk

11 **Correspondence Following Committee Meeting** (Pages 3 - 16)

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref: RDB/RP/MM/21.01.2020

22 January 2020

Councillor Michael Michael,
Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment,
County Hall,
Atlantic Wharf,
Cardiff CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Michael,

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 21st January 2020

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 21st January 2020 to discuss the item on 'Education Campaign to Support Improving Recycling Performance'. The comments and observations made by Members on the areas relevant to your portfolio of responsibility are set out in this letter.

Education Campaign to Support Improving Recycling Performance

- **Pink Sticker Scheme** - Members welcome the introduction of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme, and see it as a positive step forward that should help Cardiff make improvements on current recycling rates. They feel that the initiative will provide the short term support and longer term sanctions necessary to improve the quality of recycling in Cardiff.
- **Potential Municipal Waste Sticker** - Municipal Waste Long term, the Committee believe that the Council could apply a similar 'Pink Sticker' approach to the municipal waste stream, i.e. a sticker that is used to identify municipal waste that includes material that can be recycled. They accept the argument that such a change should not be introduced immediately as the public needs to adapt to the current proposal, however, they feel that this is something that the Council could look at in the future.
- **Enhancing Technology** - Members were told that the Council is looking to enhance waste collection technology, for example, by potentially introducing RFID stickers to improve the quality and speed of data

collection. The Committee welcome this approach as it will improve the data held by the Council, putting it in an informed position so that it can better target waste collection resources. These improvements could help the Council develop a localised picture of waste collection, for example, tailored ward information, and ultimately create a bespoke collection approach that will only help in increasing recycling rates.

- **Educational Support** - Members were told that scanning the sticker or typing in the website link would take residents directly to the Council's 'Recycling and Waste' page which would provide information on how to recycle and process a range of materials. This system works for those who are IT literate and can read English and Welsh, however, it presents challenges for those who can't. I would be grateful if you could provide details of how you propose to support those who are not IT literate, or are unable to read Welsh and / or English.
- **Recycling & Waste Webpage Review** - As explained above, the 'Pink Sticker' directs the public to the 'Recycling and Waste' page that contains information on how to recycle and process a range of waste materials in Cardiff. The Committee believe that to maximise the impact of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme the page needs to be as engaging and interactive as possible, therefore, recommend that Recycling & Waste Management review the information on the site to identify how improvements might be made.
- **Nappy Collections** - A Member commented on a number of missed nappy collections, and the problems that this had presented for some local residents. An officer explained that the Council was working with Welsh Government to improve the reliability of collection schedules, and to roll out 'yellow nappy bins' across the city. The Committee welcome this, and ask that you keep them informed of the proposed improvements.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the content of this letter.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Ramesh Patel', with a stylized, cursive script.

Councillor Ramesh Patel

Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

- Sarah McGill - Director of People & Communities
- Matt Wakelam – Assistant Director, Street Scene
- Davina Fiore - Director of Governance & Legal Services
- Members of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref: RDB/RP/CW/21.01.2020

22 January 2020

Councillor Caro Wild,
Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport,
County Hall,
Atlantic Wharf,
Cardiff CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Wild,

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 21st January 2020

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 21st January 2020 to discuss 'Cardiff's Transport White Paper'. The comments and observations made by Members on the areas relevant to your portfolio of responsibility are set out in this letter.

Cardiff's Transport White Paper

- **A Positive Transport Ambition** - Members are supportive of the proposed ten-year transport vision that is set out in the draft 'Transport White Paper'. They believe that if the combination of schemes contained within the document are delivered, then moving around Cardiff will become easier, air quality will improve and both carbon emissions from vehicles and congestion will reduce.
- **Cross City Connectivity** - The Committee is fully behind the proposals that are designed to improve connectivity across Cardiff. For example, some of the Members have regularly championed the importance of improving east / west transport connectivity to reduce journey times and avoid non-essential trips in and out of the city centre. They believe that projects such as the Cardiff Crossrail Tram – Train Line, the Cardiff Circle Line and new cross-city bus network will address this longstanding problem.

- **Importance of Engaging with Bus Companies** – Improving bus provision in the city is a core aim of the draft 'Transport White Paper'. Indeed, section 2 of the document titled 'Bus Growth' is exclusively dedicated to improving bus travel into and around the city. During the meeting a Member commented on the importance of the bus as a mode of transport in the draft 'Transport White Paper', and asked for details on how much engagement had happened with the various private bus companies who operate in the city. He was told that regular engagement had taken place with the private bus companies, however, much work still needed to happen to deliver the vision set out in the plan – for example, developing governance and partnership agreements. The Committee see that bus has a central place in Cardiff's transport plans, therefore, ask that you ensure that the Council works and fully engages with all of the private bus companies during every stage of the delivery of the plan.

- **Deliverability & Funding** - While the Committee supports the ambition and vision contained within the draft 'Transport White Paper', they have a number of concerns on the deliverability and funding of the proposals. With this in mind I would be grateful if you could reflect on and respond to the following comments:
 - Given the Council's track record of delivering large transport infrastructure projects on time (for example, the bus station), please provide the Committee with some assurance that the 10 year vision is achievable, along with an explanation as to why you believe this to be the case.

 - The Committee understands that delivering large infrastructure projects is a complicated undertaking that regularly encounters unforeseen challenges. That said, the Council has been involved with many schemes over the years and so should have sufficient experience to plan accordingly. I would ask that planning is underpinned by 'lessons learnt' from other major projects, that the Council adheres to best practice throughout delivery, that 'slippage' is built into the planning

timeline and that the Council maintains a series of 'plan B' options to turn to should the worst happen.

- It is clear from the initial launch of the draft 'Transport White Paper' that funding is a concern. Public reaction to various options has been mixed, for example, towards the £2 congestion charge for non-Cardiff residents, but it remains the case that the £1 - £2 billion price tag is a significant barrier to delivery. You explained that issues including funding mechanisms had been raised with the Welsh government, and that they had provided a constructive response to the proposals in a letter. I would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with a copy of the Welsh Government letter in your response to this letter.
- Members believe that transport infrastructure needs to be in place before any charging takes place, and that any monies raised should be specifically ring-fenced for transport infrastructure. For example, it would seem wrong to charge people for driving into or out of certain parts of Cardiff without providing a practical alternative.
- At the meeting you and officers were asked if the Council has enquired about any newly available funding that might arise as a consequence of the scrapped M4 relief road. An officer explained that the point had been raised, and that conversations had taken place. The Committee ask that you pursue this potential funding avenue as it could provide the required catalyst to accelerate the delivery of many of the schemes set out in the draft 'Transport White Paper'.
- I would be grateful if you could explain how the £1 bus journeys scheme will work, and provide detail of how it might be funded, for example, is it anticipated that it will be paid for from a one off capital payment, or will it create long term pressures on Council revenue budgets.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the content of this letter.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Ramesh Patel', with a stylized, cursive script.

Councillor Ramesh Patel

Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

- Andrew Gregory - Director of Planning, Transport & Environment
- Jason Bale - Jason Bale, Programme Manager, Clean Air
- Professor Mark Barry - Cardiff University
- Professor Stuart Cole CBE – University of South Wales
- Davina Fiore - Director of Governance & Legal Services
- Members of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Ref: RDB/RP/SE.MM.CW/21.01.2020

22 January 2020

Councillors Elsmore, Michael & Wild,
Cabinet Members – Cardiff Council,
County Hall,
Atlantic Wharf,
Cardiff CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillors Elsmore, Michael & Wild,

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 21 January 2020

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the supporting officers for attending the meeting that took place on Tuesday 21 January 2020. As you are aware the meeting received an item titled 'Cabinet response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality''. The comments and observations made by Members following this item are set out in this letter.

Cabinet response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'

- **Positive Report Response** - The Committee is pleased by number of recommendations that have been accepted, and the overall positive response to the report. In particular, they welcome the comments that were made by Councillor Wild during his opening statement that thanked the Committee for the piece of work and the valuable contribution that it made. Members are happy that the report has had a positive impact, and look forward to working with the Cabinet and service areas in future for the benefit of Cardiff.
- **Recommendation 6 – Low Emission Neighbourhoods** – During the meeting Members questioned why Recommendation 6 had been rejected, when the draft 'Transport White Paper' had talked about similar initiatives being delivered across the city, for example, 'streets for health'. Councillor Wild explained that if the timing had been slightly different, and with some

reflection, 'Recommendation 6' could have been accepted as it is something that aligns with the aims of the Transport White Paper. I would be grateful if you could revisit this recommendation and provide the Committee with feedback on your conclusion.

- **Bold Taxi Statement** - The first part of 'Recommendation 19' states that:
 - *The Council makes a clear statement that sets out the Council's ambitions for taxi emission standards in the city and explains out how this might be achieved, for example, Nottingham has stated that it wants to significantly reduce taxi emissions in the city by converting all of its taxi fleet to electric by 2025.*

This was not properly addressed in the Cabinet response so I asked if there were any proposals to publish a target date for improving taxi standards, which would clearly signal Cardiff's ambition and intent for the taxi fleet. I was provided with a response which listed a number of challenges, for example, vehicle affordability and access to credit, that appear to have created a barrier to prevent a bold statement of intention being made. The Committee believe that the Council needs to produce such a positive statement to help drive taxi improvements, therefore, Members would be grateful if you could reconsider this response.

- **Local Motor Industry** - The Committee is disappointed at the response to 'Recommendations 23 & 24' which focus on developing closer working ties with the local motor industry. They felt that developing these relationships could only help increase the popularity of low emission vehicles, which would be a positive thing for Cardiff. On this basis, the Committee ask that you reconsider this response and as a minimum ensure that all local car dealerships are aware of all of the electric charging points in Cardiff, including those provided by the Council.
- **Electric Charging Points** - At the meeting I asked about the new electric charging points that had been rolled out across Cardiff, along with the rationale as to how and why the chosen sites had been selected. The

Director for Planning, Transport & Environment explained that the decisions were based on public response and access to the grid. The Committee would be grateful if you could provide details of all of the new Council electric charging points and the information that was used to select the sites.

- **Innovative & Linked Solutions** - During the meeting Councillor Michael explained that the Cardiff electricity supply was probably insufficient to cope with its motoring needs, should everyone decide to switch to electric. A Member acknowledged that this might be a problem, but then suggested that such challenges required an all Cardiff solution, for example, increasing the energy production and efficiency of new build properties and then diverting the saved energy into alternatives like fuelling vehicles. His basic message was all aspects of energy consumption were linked, and that the Council should fully engage with all of the recommendations in the report to achieve innovative solutions.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the content of this letter.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Ramesh Patel', written in a cursive style.

Councillor Ramesh Patel
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

- Andrew Gregory, Director of Planning, Transport & Environment;
- Jason Bale, Programme Manager, Clean Air;
- Davina Fiore, Director of Governance & Legal Services;
- Members of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee.

This page is intentionally left blank



Fy Nghyf / My Ref: CM42983

Dyddiad / Date: 27th February 2020

Councillor Ramesh Patel
Chairperson
Environmental Scrutiny Committee
County Hall
Atlantic Wharf
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Annwyl/Dear Councillor Patel

Environmental Scrutiny Committee - 21st January 2020

Thank you for your correspondence dated 22nd January regarding the Educational Campaign to Improve Recycling.

Firstly, thank you for your support for the Pink Sticker Scheme. I have addressed each of your queries in turn below:

Potential Municipal Waste Sticker - At present, the majority of municipal waste is placed in a non-translucent sack within a wheeled bin making it difficult for collections crews to identify what items the bin contains. It would therefore be difficult to adopt this approach when collecting the waste. However, we accept that in the future, Enforcement Officers could pursue this approach if there is an identifiable lack of recycling, such as food recycling.

Enhancing Technology - Whilst we are continuously looking for ways to enhance our services, RFID is not cost effective or practical at this time. Firstly, not all of the city is on bins. Most other authorities using RFID only do so for commercial waste collections due to the expense of fitting the technology to the vehicle and the bins. The volume of bins in Cardiff means that the costs of such a scheme would be significant.

ATEBWCH I / PLEASE REPLY TO :

Swyddfa Cymorth Y Cabinet / Cabinet Support Office, Ystafell / Room 518, Neuadd y Sir / County Hall
Glanfa'r Iwerydd / Atlantic Wharf, Caerdydd/Cardiff, CF10 4UW
Ffon / Tel: (029) 2087

GWEITHIO DROS GAERDYDD, GWEITHIO DROSOCH CHI

Mae'r Cyngor yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg, Saesneg neu'n ddwyieithog. Byddwn yn cyfathrebu â chi yn ôl eich dewis, dim ond i chi roi gwybod i ni pa un sydd well gennych. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

WORKING FOR CARDIFF, WORKING FOR YOU

The Council welcomes correspondence in Welsh, English or bilingually. We will ensure that we communicate with you in the language of your choice, as long as you let us know which you prefer. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay.



Our current in cab system BarTec is providing us with a wealth of data that can be presented to support informed decision-making. The best way to improve our data and our customers experience is to develop the in-cab technology that we have in place. For example, by linking BarTec to the weighbridge systems, enabling the production of ward performance data on recycling.

Educational Support - A series of outreach events have been arranged to target members of the public who may not have seen the campaign online. The team will discuss the campaign with residents and emphasise the main goal which is to improve the quality of material collected. A series of educational leaflets have been made available in 14 different languages and are available online.

Recycling & Waste Webpage Review - The URL www.cardiff.gov.uk/pinksticker has been created by the web team. This content is signed off and is currently with Welsh Translations. As soon as we receive the translations, the full pink sticker content will be visible in time for the 2nd March 2020 launch date.

Nappy Collections - We will ensure that any further developments in this area are communicated to the Committee.

I trust the above is of assistance. If you have any further enquiries, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yn gywir
Yours sincerely



Councillor / Y Cynghorydd Michael Michael
Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment
Aelod Cabinet dros Strydoedd Glân, Ailgylchu a'r Amgylchedd